

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MISSOURI
EASTERN DIVISION**

IN RE: CROP INPUTS ANTITRUST LITIGATION	Case No. 4:21-md-02993-SEP
This Document Relates To: ALL CASES	MDL No. 2993

NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY

Plaintiffs submit this Notice of Supplemental Authority in further support of their Opposition to Defendants’ Joint Motion to Dismiss, ECF No. 141.

On January 12, 2024, the United States District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina entered a Memorandum Opinion and Order (the “FTC Opinion”) denying Defendants’ Motions to Dismiss claims made against Syngenta Crop Protection AG, Syngenta Corporation, Syngenta Crop Protection, LLC, and Corteva, Inc. *FTC et al. v. Syngenta Crop Protection AG*, 1:22CV828, ECF No. 160 (M.D.N.C. Jan. 12, 2024) [**attached hereto as Exhibit 1**]. Although the FTC Opinion is from a court outside of this District, the opinion’s reasoning addresses cases from multiple circuits and is persuasive authority bearing on the issues presented in this case at the motion to dismiss stage.

In this case, two central issues in the parties’ briefing on Defendants’ Motion to Dismiss were (1) whether Plaintiffs’ allegations of Defendants’ alleged parallel conduct supported a plausible conspiracy, and (2) whether the Crop Inputs market was adequately defined. (Pls.’ Mem. in Opp’n to Defs.’ Joint Mot. to Dismiss Pls.’ Consol. Class Action Compl., 19, 12-22, ECF No. 164.)

The court in the FTC action affirmed that the assessment of adequate market definition at the motion to dismiss stage is a “fact-intensive inquiry” and that “the scope of the relevant product market differs on a case-by-case basis.” (FTC Opinion, p. 25). The court also pointed to the Fourth Circuit’s assessment that “[b]ecause market definition is a deeply fact-intensive inquiry, courts hesitate to grant motions to dismiss for failure to plead a relevant product market.” (FTC Opinion, p. 25 (citing *E.I. du Pont de Nemours and Co. v. Kolon Indus.*, 637 F.3d 435, 442 (4th Cir. 2011))).

The court in the FTC action also rejected the defendants’ challenge to the plausibility of the plaintiffs’ allegations, highlighting that the claims were supported by ample factual allegations. The court held that plaintiffs’ allegations of defendants’ loyalty programs causing substantial foreclosure of the generic herbicide market were plausible and, moreover, that defendants’ attacks on plausibility “turn[] on a factual dispute ill suited for the pleadings stage.” (FTC Opinion, p. 65) (citing *FTC v. Surescripts, LLC*, 424 F.Supp.3d 92, 104 (D.D.C. 2020)). Similarly, the court found that defendants’ contentions regarding the pro-competitive effects or the absence of anticompetitive injury caused by the loyalty discount programs at the center of the FTC action “depended on further factual development” at the motion to dismiss stage. (FTC Opinion, p. 67).

Plaintiffs therefore respectfully submit that this Court should consider the FTC Opinion as supplemental authority.

Dated: January 26, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

s/ Derek Y. Brandt

**McCUNE LAW GROUP, McCUNE
WRIGHT AREVALO VERCOSKI**

KUSEL WECK BRANDT, APC

Derek Y. Brandt. (6228895 IL)

Leigh M. Perica (6316856 IL)

Connor P. Lemire (704702 MA)

231 N. Main Street, Suite 20

Edwardsville, IL 62025
Telephone: (618) 307-6116
dyb@mccunewright.com
lmp@muccunewright.com
cpl@mccunewright.com

Plaintiffs' Liaison Counsel

s/ W. Joseph Bruckner (w/consent)

**LOCKRIDGE GRINDAL NAUEN
P.L.L.P.**

W. Joseph Bruckner (0147758 MN)
Rebecca A. Peterson (241858 MN)
Robert K. Shelquist (21310x MN)
Brian D. Clark (0390069 MN)
Craig S. Davis (0148192 MN)
100 Washington Avenue So., Suite 2200
Minneapolis, MN 55401
Telephone: (612) 339-6900
Facsimile: (612) 339-0981
wjbruckner@locklaw.com
rapeterson@locklaw.com
rkshelquist@locklaw.com
bdclark@locklaw.com
csdavis@locklaw.com

s/ Sterling Aldridge (w/consent)

BARRETT LAW GROUP, P.A.

John W. "Don" Barrett (2063 MS)
Sterling Aldridge (104277 MS)
Katherine Barrett Riley (99109 MS)
David McMullan, Jr. (8494 MS)
P.O. Box 927
404 Court Square North
Lexington, MS 39095
Telephone: (662) 834-2488
Facsimile: (662) 834-2628
dbarrett@barrettlawgroup.com
sstarns@barrettlawgroup.com
kbriley@barrettlawgroup.com
dmcmullan@barrettlawgroup.com

s/ Michelle Looby (w/consent)

GUSTAFSON GLUEK PLLC

Dan Gustafson (202241 MN)
Michelle Looby (0388166 MN)
Daniel C. Hedlund (258337 MN)
Daniel J. Nordin (0392393 MN)
Kaitlyn L. Dennis (0397433 MN)
Canadian Pacific Plaza
120 South Sixth Street, Suite 2600
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Telephone: (612) 333-8844
dgustafson@gustafsongluek.com
mlooby@gustafsongluek.com
dhedlund@gustafsongluek.com
dnordin@gustafsongluek.com
kdennis@gustafsongluek.com

Plaintiffs' Interim Co-Lead Class Counsel

**COTCHETT, PITRE & MCCARTHY,
LLP**

EDELSON LECHTZIN LLP
Marc Edelson (51834 PA)

Adam Zapala (245748 CA)
Elizabeth Castillo (280502 CA)
Karin B. Swope (24015 WA)
James G.B. Dallal (277826 CA)
840 Malcom Road, Suite 200
Burlingame, CA 94010
Telephone: (650) 697-6000
azapala@cpmlegal.com
ecastillo@cpmlegal.com
kswope@cpmlegal.com
jdallal@cpmlegal.com

HELLMUTH & JOHNSON PLLC

Michael R. Cashman (206945 MN)
Anne T. Regan (0333852 MN)
Nathan D. Prosser (0329745 MN)
8050 West 78th Street
Edina, MN 55439
Telephone: (952) 941-4005
Facsimile: (952) 941-2337
mcashman@hjlawfirm.com
aregan@hjlawfirm.com
nprosser@hjlawfirm.com

PAUL LLP

Richard M. Paul III (44233 MO)
Ashlea G. Schwarz (60102 MO)
601 Walnut Street, Suite 300
Kansas City, MO 64106
Telephone: (816) 984-8100
Facsimile: (816) 984-8108
Rick@PaulLLP.com
Ashlea@PaulLLP.com

SHARP LAW LLP

Ruth Anne French-Hodson (65461 MO)
Rex. A. Sharp (51205 KS)
Isaac L. Diel (39503 MO)
Gregory M. Bentz (33369 MO)
4820 West 75th Street
Prairie Village, KS 66208
Telephone: (913) 901-0505
rsharp@midwest-law.com

Sati Gibson (90316 PA)
3 Terry Drive, Suite 205
Newton, PA 18940
Telephone: (215) 867-2399
Medelson@edelson-law.com
sgibson@edelson-law.com

LABATON SUCHAROW

Gregory S. Asciolla (2635241 NY)
Karin E. Garvey (2997831 NY)
Jonathan S. Crevier (5592753 NY)
140 Broadway
New York, NY 10005
Telephone: (212) 907-0700
gasciolla@labaton.com
kgarvey@labaton.com
jcrevier@labaton.com

**REINHARDT WENDORF &
BLANCHFIELD**

Mark Reinhardt (90530 MN)
Garrett D. Blanchfield (209855 MN)
Roberta A. Yard (322295 MN)
332 Minnesota Street, Suite W1050
St. Paul, MN 55101
Telephone: (651) 287-2100
Facsimile: (651) 287-2103
m.reinhardt@rwblawfirm.com
g.blanchfield@rwblawfirm.com
r.yard@rwblawfirm.com

SPECTOR, ROSEMAN & KODROFF, PC

William G. Caldes (00062-1995 NJ; 75842 PA)
Icee N. Etheridge (20256-2016 NJ; 322630 PA)
Jeffrey J. Corrigan (03078-1999 NJ; 2372654 PA)
Jeffrey L. Spector (03375-2007 NJ; 207208 PA)

rafrenchhodson@midwest-law.com
idiel@midwest-law.com
gbentz@midwest-law.com

TAUS, CEBULASH & LANDAU LLP

Archana Tamoshunas (3065661 NY)
Brett Cebulash (2612190 NY)
Kevin Landau (2835668 NY)
Evan Rosin (5255153 NY)
80 Maiden Lane, Suite 1204
New York, NY 10038
Telephone: (212) 931-0704
atamoshunas@tcclaw.com
bcebulaash@tcclaw.com
klandau@tcclaw.com
erosin@tcclaw.com

2001 Market Street, Suite 3420
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Telephone: (215) 496-0300
Facsimile: (215) 496-6611
bcaldes@srkattorneys.com
ietheridge@srkattorneys.com
jcorrigana@srkattorneys.com
jspector@srkattorneys.com

ZIMMERMAN REED

David M. Cialkowski (306526 MN)
Brian C. Gudmundson (336695 MN)
1100 IDS Center, 80 S. 8th Street
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Telephone: (612) 341-0400
David.cialkowski@zimmreed.com
Brian.gudmundson@zimmreed.com

Hart Robinovitch (240515 MN)
14646 N. Kierland Blvd., Suite 145
Scottsdale, AZ 85254
Telephone: (480) 348-6415
Hart.robinovitch@zimmreed.com

Plaintiffs' Executive Committee

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Derek Y. Brandt, hereby certify that on January 26, 2024, I electronically filed the foregoing Notice of Supplemental Authority using the Court's CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to all counsel of record.

s/ Derek Y. Brandt
